Contributions
Philosophy
Philosophia Download Papers

Syntax
From Handbook of Mereology
by Edith Moravcsik

PDP
Syntax

The conceptual tool of part-whole relations resolves a paradox: it allows for something to be viewed as both ‘one’ and ‘many’ at the same time. On the one hand, it enables us to analyse one thing as more than one by decomposing it into parts. On the other hand, it allows us to view many things as one if we posit a single whole that they are parts of. Both analytic steps facilitate generalisations: wholes that appear distinct may turn out to be similar by sharing some of their parts, and assemblages of different things may form wholes that are in some respects alike.

Both directions of mereological analysis have found abundant application in the description of sentence structure. First, it is useful to break sentences into words: the two sentences *Bill arrived* and *Bill left* are distinct as wholes but similar in that they both include the word *Bill* as their subject. Second, sequences of words can act jointly as single units, such as when an entire clause functions as the subject of the sentence [*That he arrived*] surprised *me*.

All syntacticians posit sentences as wholes and words as their parts and most will posit clauses and phrases in between as well (cf. Jackendoff 1991). Mereological structure in syntax is called constituent structure or phrase structure. (1) shows a traditional phrase structure tree of a sentence complete with category labels.

(1)

Symptoms of syntactic wholes - phrases or clauses - include joint recurrence in and across sentences, joint non-occurrence (replaceability or omissibility), and adjacency of the parts. These properties of
mereological structure are illustrated in (2) for the noun phrase.

(2)(a) Recurrence in and across sentences

(i) [The guests]NP read [the book]NP.

(ii) [The guests]NP are tired.

(b) Joint replaceability by a pro-form

[The guests]NP arrived and they left immediately.

(c) Joint omissibility

[The guests]NP arrived and ___ left immediately.

(d) Adjacency

(i) [The guests]NP arrived.

(ii) *[The] [arrived guests].

The utility of positing such wholes is shown by what happens if we do not posit them. Without the concept of noun phrase, rules of which word sequences can be subjects and objects and which can be replaced by pronouns or left out would have to be stated by listing all the parts over and over again, as in (3). The concept noun phrase simplifies these rules, as in (4).

(3) (a) A subject must be a noun, or an article and a noun, or an article and an adjective and a noun, etc.

(b) A pronoun may replace a noun, or an article and a noun, or an article and an adjective and a noun, etc.

(4) (a) A subject must be a noun phrase.

(b) A pronoun may replace a noun phrase.

(c) A noun phrase is a noun or an article and a noun or an article and an adjective and a noun, etc.

While the mereological analysis of sentences enhances the generality of descriptions, it introduces problems of its own. On the one hand, not all syntactic part-whole relations are simple; on the one hand, criteria for wholeness may be in conflict.

**Complexity.** Simple partonomic systems would involve only two sister parts for each whole, no parts within parts, parts that are equal, each part uniquely assigned to a single whole, and wholes that are compositional (i.e., their properties are the sum of the properties of the parts and their relations) (cf. Moravcsik 2006; 2009). There are, however, syntactic constructions that violate one or the other of these simplicity criteria. For example, in a noun phrase like *the ripe cherries*, the adjective *ripe* and the noun *cherries* are not on equal footing in that the noun phrase is grammatical without the adjective (*the cherries*) but not without the noun (*the ripe*).

Another complex syntactic mereological pattern is a part simultaneously belonging to two wholes. Thus, in *Jill expects him to succeed*, the pronoun *him* belongs both to the main clause *Jill expects him* and to the subordinate clause *him to succeed*. Such instances of what is called multiple motherhood have
been dealt with differently in various syntactic theories. In Word Grammar, *him* is represented as simultaneously dependent on both verbs: *expects* and *succeed* (Hudson 1984: 112). Other approaches in turn solve the problem by an additional application of partonomy: rather than assuming a single structure, they assign two constituent structures to each sentence. Thus, in some versions of transformational grammar, *him* is the subject of the subordinate clause in underlying structure and is subsequently “raised” into the main clause by a transformation (Postal 1974).

**Conflicting criteria.** A common way in which wholeness criteria are in conflict involves adjacency: words of what otherwise appears to be a phrase or a clause may not be contiguous. For example, (5) and (6) show that the English noun and relative clause may or may not be adjacent.

(5) (a) The man that came to see me is German.
(b) The man is German that came to see me.

Yet, for purposes of replaceability, noun and relative clause form a phrase whether they are adjacent or not.

(6) (a) **The man that came to see me** is German. He was kind.
(b) The man is German that came to see me. He was kind.

Discontinuous constituency has been a central problem in syntactic theorising (Huck & Ojeda 1987). One solution is once again by splitting a single structure into two layers. For sentences like (5b), surface structure would have the relative clause separated from the noun but in the underlying structure, the clause is adjacent to the noun, just as in (5a). Underlying structure thus regularises the linearly deviant construction (see for example Jacobs & Rosenbaum 1968). Other analyses (e.g. Sadock 1987) assume that the non-adjacent noun and relative clause do not form a phrase in syntax but they do so in semantics.

In sum: mereological analysis solves some problems in syntax and poses others. Many of the differences among syntactic theories boil down to varying attempts to represent the exact nature of constituent structure and to resolve its complexities and contradictions.

See also > Grammar, Linguistic Structures, Paradoxes, Possessives and Partitives, Structure.

**Bibliographical remarks**


Tversky, B., 1990. An overall analysis of partonomic structures in language

References and further readings


Edith Moravczik
Handbook of Mereology
Contributors and their contribution(s)

Albertazzi, Liliana
Department of Humanities, University of Trento
Perceptual Whole ISBN 978-3-88405-643-1

Andrae, Benjamin
Munich School of Philosophy, Ludwig-Maximilians University
Experience ISBN 978-3-88405-602-8

Arlig, Andrew
Department of Philosophy, Brooklyn College, CUNY
Abelard ISBN 978-3-88405-560-1
Boethius ISBN 978-3-88405-579-3
Medieval Mereology ISBN 978-3-88405-628-8

Bäck, Allan
Department of Philosophy, Kutztown University
Aristotle’s Theory of Parts ISBN 978-3-88405-567-0
Reduplication ISBN 978-3-88405-659-2
Syllogism ISBN 978-3-88405-675-2

Beck, Hans
Institute for Physics, University of Neuchâtel
Chaos ISBN 978-3-88405-587-8

Boucher, Pol
Institut de l’Ouest: Droit et Europe, University of Rennes

Bränmark, Johan
Department of Global Political Studies, Malmö University
Ethics ISBN 978-3-88405-601-1
The Good Life ISBN 978-3-88405-610-3

Bromand, Joachim
Institute of Philosophy, University of Bonn; Institute of Philosophy, RWTH Aachen University
Paradoxes ISBN 978-3-88405-641-7

Burkhardt, Hans
Department of Philosophy, Ludwig-Maximilians University at Munich
Albert of Saxony ISBN 978-3-88405-564-9
Medicine ISBN 978-3-88405-626-4
Mereological Triangle (with Stamatios Gerogiorgakis) ISBN 978-3-88405-631-8
Radulphus Brito ISBN 978-3-88405-657-8
Scherzer (with Stamatios Gerogiorgakis) ISBN 978-3-88405-663-9

Cameron, Ross P.
Department of Philosophy, University of Virginia
Mereological Essentialism ISBN 978-3-88405-630-1

Cohnitz, Daniel
Department of Philosophy and Religious Studies, Utrecht University
Goodman, Nelson (with Marcus Rossberg) ISBN 978-3-88405-611-0
Structure of Appearance, Goodman’s (with Marcus Rossberg) ISBN 978-3-88405-669-1

Correia, Fabrice
Department of Philosophy, University of Geneva
Ontological Dependence ISBN 978-3-88405-639-4

Cosans, Christopher
Department of Philosophy, University of Maryland
Animals ISBN 978-3-88405-565-6

Cotnoir, A. J.
Department of Philosophy, University of St Andrews
Non-Wellfounded Mereology ISBN 978-3-88405-638-7

Donnelly, Maureen
Department of Philosophy, University at Buffalo
Granularity ISBN 978-3-88405-613-4

Eberle, Rolf
Faculty of Philosophy, University of Rochester
Order ISBN 978-3-88405-640-0
Pietruszczak, Andrzej
Department of Logic, Nicolaus Copernicus University
Metamathematics of Mereology

Polli, Roberto
Department of Philosophy, University of Trento
Aristotle’s Theory of Wholes
ISBN 978-3-88405-568-7

Potter, Luke
Department of Philosophy, University of Notre Dame
Material constitution (with Michael Rea)
ISBN 978-3-88405-625-7

Rea, Michael
Department of Philosophy, University of Notre Dame
Material constitution (with Luke Potter)
ISBN 978-3-88405-625-7

Reicher, Maria E.
Department of Philosophy, RWTH Aachen University
Meinong ISBN 978-3-88405-629-5

Rijkhoff, Jan
Department of Linguistics, Aarhus University
Linguistic Structures
ISBN 978-3-88405-622-6
Non-literal Language Use and Part-Whole Relations ISBN 978-3-88405-637-0

Rosiak, Marek
Department of Logic, University of Lodz
Husserl ISBN 978-3-88405-617-2
Ingarden ISBN 978-3-88405-618-9
Twardowski ISBN 978-3-88405-685-1

Rossberg, Marcus
Philosophy Department, University of Connecticut
Goodman, Nelson (with Daniel Cohnitz)
ISBN 978-3-88405-611-0
Structure of Appearance, Goodman’s (with Daniel Cohnitz) ISBN 978-3-88405-669-1

Rueger, Alex
Faculty of Arts, University of Alberta
Dynamical Systems (with Patrick McGivern)
ISBN 978-3-88405-598-4

Salice, Alessandro
Philosophy Department, University College Cork
Brentano ISBN 978-3-88405-582-3
Intentionality ISBN 978-3-88405-619-6
Mally ISBN 978-3-88405-624-0
Reinach ISBN 978-3-88405-660-8
Stumpf ISBN 978-3-88405-670-7

Sanford, David H.
Department of Philosophy, Duke University
Naïve Mereology
ISBN 978-3-88405-634-9
Sum ISBN 978-3-88405-674-5

Schaffer, Jonathan
Department of Philosophy, Rutgers University
Metaphysical Atomism
ISBN 978-3-88405-572-4

Schalley, Andrea C.
Department of Language, Literature and Intercultural Studies, Karlstad University
Common Sense Reasoning About Parts and wholes ISBN 978-3-88405-591-5

Schantz, Richard
Department of Philosophy, University of Siegen
Gestalt ISBN 978-3-88405-608-0

Scherb, Jürgen L.
Department of Philosophy, Ludwig-Maximilians University at Munich
Anselm ISBN 978-3-88405-566-3

Schneider, Benjamin
Department of Philosophy, University of Hamburg
Bolzano ISBN 978-3-88405-580-9

Seibt, Johanna
Department for Philosophy and the History of Ideas, University Aarhus
Activity ISBN 978-3-88405-563-2
Homeomerous and Automerous ISBN 978-3-88405-616-5
Subject (with Bartłomiej Skowron)
ISBN 978-3-88405-671-4
Transitivity ISBN 978-3-88405-683-7

Sedley, David
Christ’s College, University of Cambridge
Atomism in Ancient Greek Philosophy
ISBN 978-3-88405-571-7
Silberstein, Michael  
Department of Philosophy, Elizabethtown College  
Conscious Experience  
ISBN 978-3-88405-592-2

Quantum Mechanics  
ISBN 978-3-88405-655-4

Simons, Peter  
Department of Philosophy, Trinity College Dublin  
Artifact ISBN 978-3-88405-570-0  
Category ISBN 978-3-88405-585-4  

Skowron, Bartłomiej  
International Center for Formal Ontology, Faculty of Administration and Social Sciences, Warsaw University of Technology  
Subject (with Johanna Seibt) ISBN 978-3-88405-671-4

Stephan, Achim  
Institute of Cognitive Science, Osnabrück University  
Emergence ISBN 978-3-88405-600-4

Storm-Henningsen, Peter  
Lillebælt Academy, University of Applied Sciences  
Art ISBN 978-3-88405-569-4

Tegtmeier, Erwin  
Department of Philosophy, University of Mannheim  
Continuants and Occurrents ISBN 978-3-88405-593-9  

Thom, Paul  
Department of Philosophy, University of Sydney  
Parmenides ISBN 978-3-88405-642-4  
Stoics ISBN 978-3-88405-667-7

van Zantwijk, Temilo  
Institut of Philosophy, Friedrich-Schiller-University Jena  
Rhetoric ISBN 978-3-88405-661-5

von Wachter, Daniel  
International Academy of Philosophy in the Principality of Liechtenstein  
God ISBN 978-3-88405-609-7

Woleński, Jan  
Department of Social Sciences, University of Information, Technology and Management at Rzeszow  
Leśniewski and Polish mereology ISBN 978-3-88405-621-9

Woods, John  
Department of Philosophy, University of British Columbia  

Wyllie, Guilherme  
Department of Philosophy, Fluminense Federal University  
Prædicabilia ISBN 978-3-88405-652-3  
Totum potentiale ISBN 978-3-88405-682-0

Woleński, Jan  
Department of Social Sciences, University of Information, Technology and Management at Rzeszow  
Leśniewski and Polish mereology ISBN 978-3-88405-621-9